

**IEEE-SA STANDARDS BOARD PROCEDURES COMMITTEE (ProCom)**

**MEETING MINUTES**

**05 November 2019**

**IEEE Operations Center, Piscataway, New Jersey, USA**

**5:00 p.m. – 6:30 p.m.**

**Attendees**

**Members Present:**

Ted Burse, Chair  
Jean-Philippe Faure  
Travis Griffith  
Annette Reilly  
Dorothy Stanley  
Philip Winston  
Howard Wolfman

**Members Absent:**

Phil Wennblom

**IEEE Staff:**

Christy Bahn  
Kim Breitfelder  
Matthew Ceglia  
Ravindra Desai  
Karen Evangelista  
Jonathan Goldberg  
Jodi Haasz  
Yvette Ho Sang  
Soo Kim  
Gregory Marchini  
Ashley Moran  
Mary Lynne Nielsen  
Nikoi Nikoi  
Lisa Perry  
Dave Ringle, Administrator  
Pat Roder  
Sam Sciacca  
Tom Thompson  
Lisa Weisser  
Malia Zaman

Meng Zhao

**IEEE Outside Legal Counsel:**

Claire Topp

**Guests:**

Chuck Adams

Michael Atlass

Edward Au

Alan Berkema

Cindy Bian

Marc Block

Evelyn Chen

John D'Ambrosia

Stephen Dukes

Doug Edwards

Ramy Ahmed Fathy

Robert Fish

Scott Gilfillan

Latonia Gordon

Simon Hicks

Guido Hiertz

Gary Hoffman

Rich Hulett

John Kulick

David Law

Joseph Levy

Marco Lo Bue

Kevin Lu

Andrew Myles

Paul Nikolich

Gil Ohana

Kishik Park

Robby Robson

Jon Rosdahl

Matteo Sabattini

Donnie Swing

Lore Unt

Lei Wang

Hironori Washizaki

Helene Workman

Don Wright

Isamu Yamada

1 CALL TO ORDER

Chair Burse called the meeting to order at 5:02 p.m.

2 INTRODUCTIONS

There was a round of introductions from all present.

3 APPROVAL OF AGENDA

**There was a motion to approve the agenda. In the absence of objection, the motion was approved.**

4 APPROVAL OF THE [11 JUNE 2019 ProCom MINUTES](#)

**There was a motion to approve the June meeting minutes. In the absence of objection, the motion was approved.**

5 OLD/UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None

6 NEW BUSINESS

6.1 [Proposed Updates](#) to SASB OpMan RE: Parallel Balloting – Burse

Chair Burse reported.

**There was a motion to recommend the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual* changes noted below to the SASB for approval consideration. In the absence of objection, the motion was approved.**

**IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual**

**5.4 Standards Association ballots**

A Standards Association balloting group shall be one of the following:

- Individuals with voting privileges
- Persons with voting privileges who are of any category other than individual

All Standards Association ballots shall be conducted by the IEEE Standards Balloting Center.

All Standards Association ballots shall be conducted by electronic means.

~~Standards Committees may conduct parallel balloting of a standard using both an individual Standards Association balloting group and an entity Standards Association balloting group. An interested Standards Committee shall make a request to the Standards Committee that is responsible for the standard as identified on the PAR to conduct parallel ballots. The decision to conduct the parallel ballots rests with the Standards Committee that is responsible for the standard as identified on the PAR, and that Standards Committee has the sole discretion on whether or not to use parallel balloting. These parallel ballots shall satisfy all corresponding Standards Association ballot conditions. The management of the parallel ballots rests with the Standards Committee responsible for the standard as identified on the PAR.~~

IEEE-SA shall maintain a single authoritative database for the list of members of the Standards Association balloting group. A request for a Standards Association balloting group membership list shall be submitted to the Standards Committee Chair. The Standards Committee Chair shall then forward such request to the IEEE-SA staff liaison for that Standards Committee. The IEEE-SA staff liaison shall fulfill the request if the standard has been approved or upon its approval. For individual-based balloting, the supplied membership list shall consist of each member's name, affiliation, and interest category. For entity-based balloting, the supplied membership list shall consist of each entity's name, the entity's designated primary voting representative (and, if designated, the alternate voting representative), entity affiliation, and entity interest category.

## 6.2 [Proposed Updates](#) to SA OpMan RE: External Representatives – Hoffman

Gary Hoffman reported.

**There was a motion to recommend the *IEEE Standards Association Operations Manual* changes noted below to the SASB for approval consideration (with final approval at the discretion of the IEEE-SA Board of Governors). The motion was unanimously approved.**

### **IEEE Standards Association Operations Manual**

#### **7.1 External Representatives**

The policies and procedures stated in this manual apply to External Representatives of ~~the~~ IEEE for which the IEEE-SA has oversight responsibility.

##### **7.1.1 Definition**

An External Representative (ER) is a volunteer who has been appointed by the IEEE-SA ~~the~~ **Board of Governors (BOG)** to represent ~~the~~ IEEE on standards matters to an

organization, committee, or entity external to the IEEE, and where a voting position on behalf of the IEEE-SA is explicitly required.

A volunteer who serves as a liaison between an IEEE-SA committee and an external committee acting only as an information conduit or expressing opinion as part of consensus building is exempt from policies and procedures described in this clause. An Owning Board/Committee (OBC) is an IEEE-SA board, an IEEE-SA committee, or Standards Committee responsible for ensuring that positions taken by an ER on technical matters represent the consensus views of the OBC and all materially interested IEEE Technical Committees that provide timely input by any deadline established by the OBC. Positions taken by an ER on policy matters are established by the IEEE-SA BOG.

### 7.1.2 Requirements and oversight

A request to establish a new ER position shall be reviewed by both the IEEE-SA BOG and the IEEE-SA Standards Board to determine the appropriateness of the ER relationship and to determine the OBC.

The ER shall be an IEEE member of any grade except Student grade and shall be a member of the IEEE-SA. The ER shall be a member or designee of the OBC.

If an OBC ceases to function as an OBC, the ER shall be responsible to the next higher board/committee until a replacement OBC is identified. The ER shall supply the next higher board/committee with the required documentation to enable it to take on this function.

The chair of an OBC shall not serve as an ER unless an exception is granted by the next higher board/committee upon the request of the OBC. The next higher board/committee may accept or deny the request and, at its discretion, may become the Owning Board/Committee for the purposes of this representation. The next higher board/committee may also grant the exception with such conditions as it believes are necessary to assure that the ER can adequately represent the IEEE-SA while serving as chair of the OBC. If the next higher board/committee becomes the OBC for the purposes of this representation, then the ER shall provide the reports described in 7.1.4 to this next higher board/committee.

The ER shall act in the best interest of the IEEE-SA at all times. The ER should refer to documented IEEE-SA objectives or consensus positions wherever possible and should encourage development and documentation of relevant objectives or positions where they do not exist.

The ER should not represent another group in the same external organization, committee, or entity to which that person is serving as an IEEE ER. However, recognizing that an ER might need to represent another group (such as his/her employer that underwrites travel costs), the ER may be permitted to represent that group as well as the IEEE-SA in the same external organization, committee, or entity. In such situations, the individual serving as an ER shall recuse himself/herself from voting on issues that would result in a conflict between his/her duty to the IEEE-SA and his/her duty to the other group. The ER shall report such situations to the OBC at the earliest practical time. Once the OBC is made aware of the situation

by the ER, the OBC shall decide the best course of action to provide the IEEE-SA position on the issue to the external organization.

### 7.1.3 Attributes

When appointing an ER, the OBC shall review the following:

- Scientific and technical expertise (e.g., membership ~~of in~~ relevant technical societies) relevant to the scope of operations and activities of the external organization, committee, or entity.
- Familiarity with the operations and goals of the specific external organization, committee, or entity.
- The ability to articulate IEEE-SA goals, objectives, and activities clearly in the context of the external organization, committee, or entity.

Before an individual can serve as an ER, the OBC shall determine that the individual does not have a conflict of interest with respect to the activities of the specific external organization, committee, or entity to which the ER would represent ~~the~~ IEEE-SA. To enable the OBC to make this determination, the individual shall

- a) File, with the OBC and the ~~Secretary-Administrator~~ of the IEEE-SA Standards Board ~~of Governors~~, a letter stating their affiliation(s). This disclosure of affiliation shall meet the requirements of *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual* sections 5.1.2.3 and 5.1.2.4 and shall be signed by the individual.
- b) File, with the OBC and the ~~Secretary-Administrator~~ of the IEEE-SA Standards Board ~~of Governors~~, a letter of endorsement from each affiliation disclosed. The letter(s) shall document several key factors relative to the position as the ER and is to be signed by both the individual and ~~an individual by someone~~ who has management responsibility for the individual for that affiliation. The letter(s) shall contain at least the following:

- 1) Statement of qualification based on expertise in respect to the attributes described above
- 2) Statement of support for providing necessary resources (e.g., time, travel expenses to meetings), and
- 3) Recognition ~~that by~~ the individual ~~and by their affiliation is of the~~ expectation ~~to act in accordance with the conditions stated in subclause 7.1.2,~~ in particular that the individual, when serving as the ER, 'shall act in the best interest of the IEEE-SA at all times'.

- c) ~~File a e~~Completed ~~the~~ IEEE-SA Conflict of Interest Disclosure Statement [~~see~~ <https://www.ieee.org/about/compliance/conflict-of-interest/coiandpob.html>] ~~with the Secretary of the IEEE-SA Standards Board.~~

~~An ER shall update existing, or file new, documentation whenever necessary due to a change in circumstances that would make the existing documentation in any way inaccurate.~~

### 7.1.4 Reports

The ER shall provide regular written reports to the OBC in a format and frequency that has been prescribed by the OBC.

### **7.1.5 Duties of the Owning Board/Committee**

#### **7.1.5.1 Appointment**

Upon recommendation of the OBC, an ER candidate shall be considered for appointment as an ER by the IEEE-SA BOG for a term of no less than one year, and may be reappointed at the discretion of the OBC. Before an individual can serve as an ER, the IEEE-SA BOG shall confirm the appointment, or reappointment, to that position. If the OBC does not shall indicate a desired term of appointment for each recommended ER candidate, it shall be for two years.

An ER may be reappointed upon recommendation of the OBC and confirmation by the IEEE-SA BOG.

An ER shall update documentation whenever necessary due to a change in circumstances that would make the documentation on file with the OBC and/or the IEEE-SA BOG substantively inaccurate, including changes in affiliation or employment.

#### **7.1.5.2 Annual review**

The OBC shall establish the report format and frequency for ERs under its responsibility (see 7.1.4).

The OBC shall provide an annual report to both the IEEE-SA BOG Board of Governors and the IEEE-SA Standards Board on the status of ERs under its responsibility.

#### **7.1.5.3 Liaison relationships with other committees within IEEE-SA**

The OBC shall should attempt to identify other committees within IEEE-SA technical communities (e.g., IEEE Societies, Standards Committees, IEEE-SA Standards Coordinating Committees, etc.) that would are likely to have an interest in positions taken-represented by the ERs under the OBC's responsibility. The OBC shall develop liaison relationships with those other committees IEEE technical communities that have indicated interest in the activities of the OBC and shall keep them informed of positions taken-represented by the ERs under the OBC's responsibility.

#### **7.1.5.4 Provision of information to materially interested individuals**

The OBC shall provide information about positions represented by ERs under its responsibility to materially interested individuals within IEEE upon request.

#### **7.1.6 Public listing of ERs**

The IEEE-SA BOG Board of Governors shall maintain a list of all ERs on the IEEE-SA web site. The web site will include a link to an email alias that will allow any comments about ER activity to be submitted to the Secretary of the IEEE-SA staff

**Board of Governors**, who will then direct their handling through appropriate channels.

6.3 [Proposed Updates](#) to SASB Bylaws RE: Standards Committee Representative to an Entity-Based Working Group – Wright

Don Wright reported.

**There was a motion to recommend the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws* changes noted below to the SASB for approval consideration (with final approval at the discretion of the IEEE-SA Board of Governors). The motion was unanimously approved.**

### **IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws**

#### **5.2.1.2 Membership requirements for standards developed under the entity method**

Officers of IEEE standards working groups developing standards under the entity method shall be representatives of Advanced Entity Members of the IEEE-SA. Designees (those designated to manage the Standards Association ballot) in the IEEE Standards Association entity ballot process shall be representatives of Advanced Entity Members.

Every entity observing a project within an IEEE-SA entity standards working group is required to be at least a Basic Entity Member of IEEE-SA, and only Advanced Entity Members can contribute and hold voting privileges. Entity nonmembers may observe at one IEEE-SA entity standards working group meeting per project.

An entity can represent either itself or another entity's interest in an entity working group. In order to be a voting member in a particular entity working group, each entity's representative shall declare that the interests of that entity are not knowingly represented by another member of the working group and that the entity is not knowingly funding directly or indirectly the participation of another person in that working group for the purposes of influencing the outcome of the vote.

Each entity project shall have at least three voting members in good standing to maintain its validity. Each entity project is required to host its working group email reflector(s) through the IEEE, with designated IEEE staff serving as administrators. **The Standards Committee responsible for the entity project is permitted to send a designated Standards Committee Representative (SCR) to meetings of that entity-based working group in a non-voting role.**

The following qualify as entities for standards-development purposes:



*Corporation:* A for-profit or not-for-profit entity that is not under the control, as defined in 5.2.1.2.1, of another entity and that is organized under articles of incorporation or similar legal structures. Limited Liability Companies are considered to be Corporations.

*Partnership:* An unincorporated association of two or more individuals who are co-owners of a business.

*Sole proprietorship:* An unincorporated business owned by a single individual.

*Government agency:* An entity that is part of an executive, legislative, or judicial branch of a government and that has sufficient discretion in the management of its own affairs to distinguish it as separate from the administrative structure of any other governmental entity.

*Academic institution:* An educational entity that, in addition to having a controlling body such as a Board of Regents or a Board of Governors, has sufficient discretion in the management of its own affairs to distinguish it as separate from the administrative structure of any other educational entity.

IEEE-SA entity standards working groups may employ up to two individuals in non-voting positions for the purposes of technical editing and other administrative functions that shall not involve technical contributions. Such individuals will be allowed to participate in working group activities as deemed appropriate and need not represent Entity Members of IEEE-SA.

IEEE-SA entity standards working groups may vote to allow individuals to offer specific technical expertise in non-voting positions at up to three entity standards working group meetings during the standards development process for a particular project. Such individuals need not represent Entity Members of IEEE-SA. However, if an individual's expenses to attend entity standards development meetings are sponsored by his or her company, that company must be at least a Basic Entity Member of IEEE-SA.

When entity standards working group meetings are co-located with IEEE individual standards working group meetings, the participants in the individual standards working group may observe such co-located entity working group meetings at up to two meetings per calendar year without having to fulfill any specific membership requirements.

#### 6.4 Disclosure of Affiliation on Presentations and Other Contributions – Law

David Law reported.

*IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual* 5.1.2.3 was displayed during the discussion.

No action was taken by ProCom at this time.

6.5 [Request for Interpretation](#) RE: Public Review – D’Ambrosia

John D’Ambrosia reported.

It was noted that the text in *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual* 5.4.5 and 5.4.6 is ambiguous/unclear.

IEEE-SA staff stated that the intention is that the purchase of a draft not be required nor verified prior to permitting someone to file IEEE public review comments.

***Action Item: Yvette Ho Sang and John D’Ambrosia will review 5.4.5 and 5.4.6 of the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual. It is anticipated that a change proposal will be submitted for the March 2020 ProCom meeting.***

6.6 [Proposed Updates](#) to [SASB Bylaws](#) and [SASB OpMan](#) RE: Open Source – Ho Sang

Yvette Ho Sang reported.

**There was a motion to recommend the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws* and *IEEE-SA Standard Board Operations Manual* changes noted below to the SASB for approval consideration (with final approval of the SASB Bylaws at the discretion of the IEEE-SA Board of Governors [BOG], and implementation of the changes to the SASB OpMan contingent upon BOG approval of the proposed changes to the SASB Bylaws). The motion was unanimously approved.**

**IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws**

**5.2.1.1 Membership requirements for standards developed under the individual method**

**Officers, Chairs, Vice Chairs, Secretaries, and Treasurers** of IEEE standards working groups developing standards under the individual method shall be members of IEEE-SA and shall also be either IEEE members of any grade, except Student grade, or IEEE affiliates. Designees (those designated to manage the Standards Association ballot) in the IEEE Standards Association individual ballot process shall be members of IEEE- SA and shall also be either IEEE members of any grade, except Student grade, or IEEE affiliates.

**5.6 Open Source Software Development**

**IEEE standards development and Industry Connections activities shall comply with all**

IEEE and IEEE-SA requirements for development of open source software, including acceptance of the Terms of Use for the IEEE Open Source Platform. Any IEEE Standards project or Industry Connections activity that intends to develop or incorporate open source software (either normatively or informatively) in the standard or Industry Connections deliverable shall indicate this intent on the PAR or ICAID. Approval by the IEEE-SA Standards Board of the PAR or ICAID that indicates possible incorporation of open source software, as well as approval by the IEEE-SA Board of Governors of the use of the IEEE Open Source Platform for these open source activities, constitutes approval for contribution, development, and maintenance of open source software for the IEEE standard or Industry Connections deliverables. An IEEE Standards project or Industry Connections activity shall not develop open source software without prior approval of the IEEE-SA Standards Board.

All Contributions of open source software for use in IEEE standards development and Industry Connections activities shall be accompanied by an approved IEEE Contributor License Agreement (CLA) appropriate for the open source license under which the Work Product will be made available. CLAs, once accepted, are irrevocable.

## IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual

### 2 Related documents

American National Standards Institute, *ANSI Essential Requirements: Due process requirements for American National Standards* (current edition).

*IEEE Standards Association Operations Manual.*

*IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws.*

*IEEE-SA Board of Governors Open Source Operations Manual.*

PAR Form.

IEEE-SA Standards Board Working Guide for Submittal of Proposed Standards and Form for Submittal of Proposed Standards. (Known as the IEEE-SA Working Guide for the Submittal of Proposed Standards.)

*IEEE Standards Style Manual.*

*Robert's Rules of Order, Newly Revised* (current edition).

### 5.4.4 Mandatory coordination

The Standards Committee shall coordinate via circulation of drafts with the following entities:

— IEEE Standards editorial staff during Mandatory Editorial Coordination, Standards Association ballot, and RevCom review

— The IEEE-SA Board of Governors when the standard incorporates (either

normatively or informatively) Open Source developed by the Standards Committee or Working Group (see 6.5 and subclause 5.6 of the *IEEE Standards Association Standards Board Bylaws*)

— The IEEE Registration Authority Committee (RAC) when the draft includes registration activity (see subclause 5.7 of the *IEEE Standards Association Operations Manual*):

- 1) The PAR indicates the possible registration of assigned names or assigned numbers to be included in or used by the proposed project.
- 2) It becomes apparent through development of the draft that:
  - a) new registration of assigned names or assigned numbers will be included in the draft that will be assigned under a standards developing organization (SDO), or a Working Group or Standards Committee would like to request authority to conduct such assignment;
  - b) the draft includes reference to, or new specifications for use of, registration activity defined external to the proposed standard.

The RAC, IEEE Standards editorial staff, or RevCom may request RAC review of a draft.

Comments from mandatory coordination entities shall be given appropriate consideration and response by the Standards Committee. At the time of project submittal to the IEEE-SA Standards Board for approval consideration as an IEEE standard, the Standards Committee shall supply the most recent mandatory coordination comments and indicate either acceptance or a request for a waiver (see 4.2.3.2).

## **6.5 Open Source**

Open Source is digital work for which the human-readable source code is available – in the preferred form for making modifications – for use, study, re-use, modification, enhancement, and re-distribution by the users. Open Source applies to software and hardware, which may include computer code, hardware designs, data, documentation, documents, and other digital objects. Other Open Source terms are defined in Clause 2 of the *IEEE-SA Board of Governors Open Source Operations Manual*.

Development of Open Source for incorporation in IEEE standards, as a normative or informative component, shall utilize the IEEE Open Source Platform and tools that are designated by IEEE for IEEE Open Source Projects. The Standards Committee and Working Group shall comply with IEEE Open Source policies and procedures, and policies of the IEEE Open Source Platform. All IEEE Open Source Projects shall be hosted on the IEEE Open Source Platform.

### **6.5.1 Project authorization**

Project authorization for the incorporation of Open Source in an IEEE standard

requires both PAR approval by the IEEE-SA Standards Board and approval by the IEEE-SA Board of Governors to host the IEEE Open Source Project on the IEEE Open Source Platform, subject to an approved open source license. Addition of Open Source to a completed standard or an active IEEE standards development project requires approval of a Revision or Modified PAR by the IEEE-SA Standards Board, as applicable.

A PAR Study Group shall not develop Open Source (neither code nor documentation).

The PAR shall indicate whether Open Source may be incorporated (whether normatively or informatively), and the type of open source license under which any Open Source developed in connection with the IEEE Open Source Project shall be distributed.

The Standards Committee and Working Group shall obtain approval from the IEEE-SA Board of Governors for development on the IEEE Open Source Platform of the IEEE Open Source Project under a single IEEE approved open source license.

Changes to the type of open source license are discouraged, and will require a Modified PAR with the request for a change of license noted in Section 8.1 of the PAR. If the license type is changed, then appropriate Contributor License Agreements (CLAs) for the new open source license must be obtained from all previous Contributors prior to publicly indicating a change in the license on the IEEE Open Source Platform. The open source license type identified on the PAR shall not be changed once the Standards Association ballot has begun.

If the PAR for an IEEE standard that incorporates Open Source expires or is withdrawn, the Standards Committee shall either

- Transfer the IEEE Open Source Project to another active standards development project (which may require a New or Modified PAR);
- Transition the IEEE Open Source Project to another project category on the IEEE Open Source Platform; or
- Transition the IEEE Open Source Project to inactive status.

### **6.5.2 Governance of IEEE Open Source Projects incorporated in IEEE standards**

Development and maintenance of the technical content (code and documentation) of IEEE Open Source Projects incorporated in an IEEE standard are the responsibility of the Standards Committee and its Working Groups. This responsibility continues as long as the standard is active. A Standards Committee may form an Open Source subgroup that coordinates Open Source development for multiple Working Groups under that Standards Committee. A Standards Committee may establish one or more Open Source subgroups to manage several IEEE Open Source Projects, or delegate responsibility to the applicable Working Group to establish its own Open Source subgroup. The Open Source subgroup shall comply with all IEEE Open Source policies and procedures, and all policies of the IEEE Open Source Platform.

An Open Source subgroup (of the Standards Committee or Working Group) shall be led by an IEEE Open Source Project Lead who shall be designated as an officer of the

responsible Standards Committee or Working Group. The IEEE Open Source Project Lead is responsible for the vitality, organization, development, evaluation, operation, security, and maintenance of an IEEE Open Source Project. The IEEE Open Source Project Lead may communicate directly with the IEEE Open Source Platform team regarding technical matters.

Each IEEE Open Source Project incorporated in an IEEE standard shall have at least one Maintainer, who may be the IEEE Open Source Project Lead. Maintainers have the authority to commit (save changes) to the IEEE code and document repository associated with an IEEE Open Source Project, and to assign Committers. Maintainers shall be a member of the Standards Committee or Working Group responsible for the project and shall be an IEEE member of any grade and a member of IEEE-SA. Committers shall be members of the Standards Committee or Working Group responsible for the project and shall be responsible for committing code to the IEEE code and document repository associated with an IEEE Open Source Project.

The IEEE Open Source Project Lead and Maintainer(s) shall be responsible for coordinating the development of Open Source with the Working Group and comment resolution group, and obtaining applicable CLAs for all Contributions to the IEEE Open Source Project.

#### **6.5.2.1 Contributions to Open Source**

An IEEE Open Source Contributor is any person who submits any material to an IEEE Open Source Project, whether as an individual or on behalf of an organization. Material may include, but is not limited to, Open Source works, comments, and marketing materials. IEEE membership is not required to be a Contributor. Every Contributor is required to obtain an IEEE account that requires agreeing to the IEEE Code of Conduct. Every submission by an IEEE Open Source Contributor shall be associated with the IEEE account of the Contributor. All Contributors to IEEE Open Source Projects incorporated in an IEEE standard shall declare their affiliation(s) (see 5.1.2.3).

All members of the Open Source subgroup shall submit CLAs applicable for the entire IEEE Open Source Project(s) for which they are responsible, or for all IEEE Open Source Projects under the applicable open source license(s). The Working Group Chair is responsible for confirming that appropriate CLAs are submitted for all Contributions to any Open Source developed by the Working Group.

Every Contribution to an IEEE Open Source Project shall have an appropriate CLA for the Contribution and be under the same open source license as indicated on the repository. If the type of open source license is changed on the PAR, updated CLAs shall be obtained from all Contributors to the IEEE Open Source Project prior to indicating a change in the license on the IEEE Open Source Platform.

#### **6.5.2.2 Application of patent policy**

The IEEE-SA patent policy applies to Open Source that is incorporated in a standard, even if a CLA has been submitted. IEEE does not determine whether there is consistency between Letters of Assurance and CLAs. A call for patents notice shall be posted on the IEEE Open Source Platform in the area where CLAs are submitted for

all Open Source developed by the Working Group that is incorporated normatively or informatively in a draft or approved standard.

The IEEE Open Source Platform, in the area where CLAs are submitted, shall have a pointer to Accepted Letters of Assurance, as well as the appropriate sections of the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws* and *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual* relating to intellectual property.

The IEEE Standards website shall make available information about all Accepted CLAs for IEEE Open Source Projects incorporated in an IEEE standard, and information about Accepted CLAs shall also be available where Accepted Letters of Assurance are posted on the website.

### **6.5.2.3 Incorporation of Open Source in standards**

IEEE standards may incorporate the use of Open Source in two ways:

- Normatively, where use of the Open Source is required when implementing the standard
- Informatively, where the Open Source is provided for information only, and not required for implementation

All IEEE standards that incorporate Open Source shall identify the appropriate use (normative or informative) of the Open Source for compliance with the standard, and the location of the software code and documentation in the IEEE Open Source repository.

Open Source that is incorporated normatively without a specific version shall not be included in the text of the draft standard unless it is marked as an Example.

Informative documentation shall be included in the published standard (e.g., as an Annex) explaining how to access and run the Open Source. The form of this documentation shall comply with the *IEEE Standards Style Manual*, and files provided to IEEE Standards editorial staff shall be compliant with requirements for standards publication.

IEEE Open Source incorporated in a draft IEEE standard that is published prior to approval of the standard by the IEEE-SA Standards Board shall include IEEE-SA disclaimer text (see the *IEEE Standards Style Manual*) on the IEEE Open Source Platform and in all IEEE Open Source in the IEEE Open Source repository for the IEEE Open Source Project.

The guidance on references listed in the *IEEE Standards Style Manual* applies to normative and informative references to Open Source. A reference shall specify one or more source code libraries within a specified project in a specified code repository. A reference may specify one or more specific versions, including “the most current version,” of each library.

Normative use of Open Source is discouraged, unless required for accuracy, functionality, safety, security, or compatibility. Open Source that is incorporated normatively without referencing specific version(s) (i.e., it is undated) shall be made

available and maintained on the IEEE Open Source Platform. This restriction does not apply to informative references.

If an IEEE standard normatively references a specific version of the Open Source (i.e., it is a dated reference), the version can be changed only through a revision of the standard, or an amendment or corrigendum to the standard. The restriction on published amendments (see 8.1.2) does not apply for amendments that are intended only to update Open Source or references to Open Source.

For normatively referenced Open Source that does not have a specific version, the Standards Committee or Working Group shall review updates to the Open Source during the standards development process and should review updates to the Open Source after IEEE-SA Standards Board approval to determine if the software continues to align with the standard, and if not, to take appropriate action (e.g., determine whether a dated reference should be noted in the standard instead).

### **6.5.3 Mandatory coordination**

During mandatory coordination, the Standards Committee shall include all Open Source developed by the Working Group and incorporated in the draft. All applicable CLA identifiers shall be submitted during Mandatory Editorial Coordination. The IEEE Open Source Community Manager and IEEE-SA IPR Staff shall review the Open Source, CLAs, and associated documentation prior to initial ballot. Mandatory coordination comments by the IEEE Open Source Community Manager and IEEE-SA IPR Staff shall be addressed prior to initial ballot.

### **6.5.4 Standards Association ballot and public review**

All IEEE draft standards that incorporate Open Source developed by an IEEE Working Group shall provide notification during the invitation to ballot and on the public review site that (a) the IEEE draft standard incorporates Open Source, (b) applicable CLA(s) are required for any Contributions to IEEE Open Source incorporated in an IEEE standard, and (c) template CLAs are available, with links to the applicable CLA templates.

During the Standards Association ballot, balloters shall be granted access to view any referenced Open Source. After the initiation of the Standards Association ballot process, the IEEE Open Source incorporated in an IEEE standard shall only be updated to reflect changes approved by the ballot group or required by IEEE for the secure and productive operation of the IEEE Open Source Platform.

The IEEE Open Source Project Lead and at least one Maintainer shall be members of the comment resolution group.

Any comments that provide modifications to IEEE Open Source may not be implemented in the IEEE Open Source or the draft standard and may not be considered unless an applicable CLA was previously submitted to IEEE. The IEEE Open Source Project Lead and Maintainer are responsible for obtaining all CLAs prior to the start of initial ballot, and prior to the next recirculation ballot if the Open Source Contribution is inserted during comment resolution.



Once the Standards Association ballot is completed for a draft standard, any IEEE Open Source developed by the Working Group that is incorporated shall not be updated until after IEEE-SA Standards Board approval, and then only if the Open Source is undated.

Public review commenters shall be granted access to view the IEEE Open Source developed by the Working Group. Any public review comments that provide modifications to the IEEE Open Source may not be implemented in the IEEE Open Source or in the draft standard and may not be considered unless an applicable CLA was previously submitted to IEEE.

#### **6.5.5 Release and maintenance of Open Source**

Release of Open Source incorporated into an IEEE standard shall occur only after approval of the standard by the IEEE-SA Standards Board, and the IEEE Open Source Project shall be included in the official IEEE listing. After the standard is approved, only Open Source that does not have a specific version (undated) may be updated without requiring a revision of the standard, or an amendment or corrigendum (see 8.1.2). Normatively referenced Open Source that is undated may be updated only with approval from the Standards Committee, Working Group, or a subgroup delegated with that responsibility, unless the changes are required by IEEE for the secure and productive operation of the IEEE Open Source Platform.

- 6.7 [Proposed Updates](#) to SASB OpMan 7.2.4 RE: Working Group Draft Sharing List – Law  
[Executive Session]

David Law reported.

ProCom entered Executive Session at 6:42 p.m.

Remaining in the room: BOG Members, SASB Members, ProCom Members, Claire Topp, Yvette Ho Sang, IEEE-SA Governance staff, IEEE-SA OPM staff, IEEE-SA Senior Directors

Executive Session concluded at 7:03 p.m.

REPORT OUT:

**ProCom recommends the *IEEE-SA Standard Board Operations Manual* changes noted below to the SASB for approval consideration.**

### **IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual**

#### **7.2.4 Technical Contributions**

If a liaison organization external to IEEE makes a technical Contribution to an IEEE draft standard, the liaison organization thereby agrees to comply with IEEE-SA's

policies and procedures related to Contributions (e.g., the IEEE-SA Copyright Policy, outlined in Clause 7 of the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws* and subclause 6.1 of the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual*; the IEEE-SA Patent Policy in regards to disclosure of potential essential patent holders, outlined in Clause 6 of the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws* and subclause 6.3 of the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual*).

If a liaison organization submits one of its copyrighted documents to a Standards Committee/Subgroup for coordination, the document shall not be considered to be a Contribution and shall not be used in any IEEE document without prior permission from the organization external to IEEE. Prior to distributing the organization's document, the Standards Committee/Subgroup shall reference the Working Group Draft Sharing List to determine if guidance is required from the IEEE-SA Program Manager.

## 7 [NEXT MEETING](#)

The next in-person ProCom meeting will occur on either 03 or 04 March 2020 in New Delhi, India.

## 8 ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:04 p.m.